

Question:

With respect to the fast of Āshūrā (10th of Muharram), we are advised to keep 2 days fast, either the 9th and 10th or 10th and 11th of Muharram. What if a person observes only the 10th of Muharram fast and does not join another day with it. Will this be permissible?

Answer:

الجواب وبالله التوفيق

With regards to a person observing the 10th of Muharram fast exclusively, and does not join another day with it (9th or 11th), there are two main opinions regarding this in the Hanafi Madhhab.

The first opinion which many of the Hanafi Fuqahā have adopted is that it is ‘**Makrūh Tanzihī**’ to fast the day of Āshūrā solely without attaching a day before or after it. They have stated that it is in fact Sunnah to fast a day with it.

One of the foundational reason for their view is the Hadīth which is recorded by Imām Ahmad,

عن ابن أبي ليلى عن داود بن علي عن ابيه عن جده قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: صوموا يوم عاشوراء
وخالفوا اليهود صوموا قبله يوما وبعده يوما. رواه احمد

“The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said, “Fast the day of Āshūrā and be different from the Jews. Fast a day before it or a day after it.”

(اعلاء السنن، جلد ۱۷۸/۹، إدارة القرآن و العلوم الإسلامية)

In light of this, the great Hanafite jurist, ‘Allāmah Shurunbulālī states in his *Marāqī Al-Falāh*,

(المسنون فهو صوم عاشوراء) فانه يكفر السنة الماضية (مع) صوم (التاسع) لصومه صلى الله عليه وسلم العاشر، و
قال: لئن بقيت الى قابل لأصومن التاسع.

(مراقي الفلاح مع الطحطاوي ص ۶۳۹، دار الكتب العلمية- بيروت)

‘Allāmah Shurunbulālī mentions that it is Sunnah to fast the day of Āshūrā and with it, the 9th of Muharram. This is because, the Nabi ﷺ fasted the 10th of Muharram and he said, “If I remain until the next year, then I will fast the ninth of Muharram (with it).”

From the aforementioned Ahādīth, many Hanafī Fuqahā have stated that it is Sunnah to fast a day with it and fasting solely the 10th of Muharram is **Makrūh Tanzihī**.

‘Allāmah Shurunbulālī further states,

(المكروه فهو قسمان مكروه تنزيهاً و مكروها تحريماً الأول) الذي كره تنزيهاً (كصوم) يوم (عاشوراء منفرداً عن التاسع)

او عن الحادي عشر.

“The Makrūh fasts are of two types: Makrūh Tanzīhī and Makrūh Tahrīmī. The first type, that which is **Makrūh Tanzīhī** is like that of the fast of Āshūrā exclusively without the 9th (of Muharram) or 11th.

The Fuqahā have mentioned that it was the custom of the Jews at that time to fast the 10th of Muharram alone. So, to avoid resemblance, the Nabi ﷺ encouraged to fast a day before or after. Hence, if one fasts solely the 10th, then it would be considered as imitating them.

In substantiation of this view, i.e. it is **Makrūh Tanzīhī** to fast the day of Āshūrā alone, mentioned below are some statements of our Hanafi Fuqahā.

‘Allāmah Haskafī states in his *Ad-Durrul Mukhtār*,

والمكروه تحريماً كالعيدين، و تنزيها كعاشوراء وحده.

“And it is considered Makrūh Tahrīmī to fast on the two Eids; and Makrūh Tanzīhī to fast the day of Āshūrā exclusively.”

‘Allāmah Ibn ‘Ābideen thereafter comments in his super-commentary titled ‘*Radd Al-Muhtār*’ stating,

(قوله: و عاشوراء وحده) أي: مفرداً عن التاسع أو عن الحادي عشر، 'امداد'، لانه تشبه باليهود، 'محيط'.

“That is, solely without fasting the 9th or 11th (with it). This is because it is in fact resembling the Jews.”

(رد المحتار على الدر المختار، جلد ٦/١٩٧، دار الثقافة و التراث-دمشق، طبعة الرففور)

In *Al-Fatāwā Al-Hindiyyah* it states,

المسنون ان يصوم عاشوراء مع التاسع كذا في فتح القدير، و يكره صوم عاشوراء مفردا كذا في محيط السرخسي.

“It is Sunnah to fast the day of Āshūrā with the 9th (of Muharram), and like that it has been mentioned in Fathul Qadīr.

It is disliked however, to fast the day of Āshūrā exclusively, and like this it has been mentioned in the Muheet of ‘Allāmah Sarakhsī.

(الفتاوى الهندية، جلد ۱/۲۲۲، دار الكتب العلمية- بيروت)

‘Allāmah Ibn Nujaim also states in his *Al Bahr Ar-Rāiq*,

و المكروه تنزيها عاشوراء مفردا عن التاسع.

“And the Makrūh Tanzīhī fast is like that of (fasting) Āshūrā (10th) exclusively without the 9th.”

(البحر الرائق، جلد ۲/۴۵۰، مكتبة رشيدية)

In addition, the great scholar of the subcontinent, *Hakīmul-Ummat*, **Maulana Ashraf Ali Thānwī** has also adopted this view. In fact, his initial opinion was that it was not Makrūh to fast solely the 10th. However, after seeing that his opinion goes against what is mentioned in *Ad-Durrul Mukbtār* he made Rujū’. Hence, his fatwa is that it is **Makrūh Tanzīhī** to fast the 10th of Muharram (Āshūrā) exclusively.

It should be noted that they have considered it to be **Makrūh Tanzīhī**. Hence, it would be **disliked** for a person to indulge in it but not sinful.

It should also be noted that if one indulges in this act which is given the ruling of ‘Makrūh’, it would not prevent one from obtaining rewards for it.

Regarding this, *Faqīhul Ummat*, **Mufti Mahmūd Hasan Gangōhī** writes,

عاشورہ کے فقط ایک روزہ پر کفایت مکروہ ہے، لیکن ثواب اس کا بھی ملے گا۔

“Fasting on the day of Āshūrā exclusively and sufficing on it is Makrūh. However, one would still obtain rewards for it.”

(فتاویٰ محمودیہ، جلد ۱۰/۱۹۳، دارالافتاء جامعہ فاروقیہ۔ کراچی)

Mufti Radhā Al-Haq also shares this opinion,

صرف عاشورہ یعنی دس محرم کا روزہ رکھنا مکروہ تنزیہی ہے، لیکن اس کے باوجود ثواب مل جائے گا، ہاں علامہ ابو بکر کاسانی نے فرمایا کہ عام حضرات نے بلا کراہت جائز قرار دیا ہے۔

“Fasting Āshūrā, i.e. 10th Muharram alone is Makrūh Tanzīhī. However, notwithstanding it, you would still receive reward for doing so. Indeed! ‘Allāmah Abu Bakr Kāsānī has mentioned that the general body of Ulamā have given jawāz for it without Karāhah (dislike).”

(فتاویٰ دارالعلوم زکریا جلد ۲/۳۱۹، زمزم پبلشرز۔ ۲۰۰۹)

As for the second opinion in the Hanafi Madhhab with regards to fasting solely the day of Āshūrā, many scholars have opined that it is not Makrūh (in any way) to do so. They have also regarded attaching a day before or after it to be Mustahabb (commendable).

‘Allāmah Kāsānī states in his *Badāi’ As-Sanāi’*,

وكره بعضهم صوم عاشوراء وحده لمكان التشبه باليهود و لم يكرهه عامتهم لانه من الأيام الفاضلة فيستحب
استدراك فضيلتها بالصوم.

“And some of them have disliked fasting the day of Āshūrā exclusively because of resembling the Jews. However, the general scholars have not disliked it because it is from the virtuous days. Hence, it is Mustahabb to obtain its virtue.”

(بدائع الصنائع في ترتيب الشرائع، جلد ۲/۲۱۸، مكتبة رشيدية كويٲه)

‘Allāmah Yūsuf Binōri explains in his *Ma’ārifus Sunan* that there are three levels with regards to fasting on Āshūrā.

He writes,

“The most virtuous is fasting the day of Āshūrā, and also fasting a day before and after it. I.e.

- i. Fasting all three days; 9th, 10th and 11th (of Muharram) together.
- ii. Less than that (in virtue) is fasting the day of Āshūrā (10th Muharram) and fasting with it- a day before **or** after.

iii. The least of them (in virtue), is fasting the day of Āshūrā (10th Muharram) **exclusively.**”

He continues, “These three scenarios are all ‘Ibādah. Some of them are above others in virtue.”

Similarly, it has been mentioned like this by ‘Allāmah Qastalāni in his **‘Al-Mawaahib’**.

Furthermore, ‘Allāmah Yūsuf Binōri then refutes the other opinion by saying,

“As for what has been mentioned in **Ad-Durrul Mukhtār** with regards to it being disliked, I.e. fasting Āshūrā exclusively, then it should be reflected on. This is because it is still in fact an ‘Ibādah, however it is surpassed by the other two types in virtue (as previously mentioned). As such, it is not possible to give it the ruling of Makrūh; For indeed the Nabi ﷺ fasted the fast of Āshūrā exclusively throughout his life, and he wished that if he had lived until the next year, he would have fasted it along with the ninth.”

(معارف السنن، جلد ۵/۴۳، سعید)

In **Fatāwā Qādhī-Khan**, the author writes,

و يستحب ان يصوم يوم عاشوراء يصوم يوما قبله او يوما بعده ليكون مخالفا لاهل الكتاب.

“It is Mustahabb to fast the day of Ashooraa with a day before it or a day after it in order to be different from the Ahlul Kitaab.”

(فتاوی قاضیخان، جلد ۱/۱۸۳، قدیمی کتب خانہ-کراچی)

Similarly, it has been mentioned in **Fatāwā As-Sirājiyyah**,

يستحب ان يصوم قبل يوم عاشوراء يوما او بعده مخالفةً لاهل الكتاب.

“It is Mustahabb (commendable) to fast a day before or after the day of Āshūrā to differ from the Ahlul-Kitāb.”

The **Muhaqqiq** then comments on the above and states,

“Fasting exclusively the day of Āshūrā is not Makrūh. This is because, fasting a day before or after it is Mustahabb (desirable), and leaving off a Mustahabb is not Makrūh.

With regards to increasing/attaching a fast to the fast of Āshūrā, this was to prevent imitating the Jews in a time when the Jews use to observe its fast. As for today, there is no knowledge of the Jews with regards to this day nor do they see it as a great day/celebrate it. Hence, this negates the ‘resembling/imitating’.

(الفتاوى السراجية، ص ١٦٦، زمزم- طبعة الأولى)

Note: If it is looked at from the angle that it is considered as Sunnah, then as ‘Allāmah Ibn ‘Ābideen states in his **Radd Al Muhtār** that it is from Sunan Az-Zawāid. He then states that leaving out such does not necessitate Karāhah (dislike).

The great contemporary scholar of the subcontinent, **Mufti Khālid Saifullah Rahmāni** has also shared this view. In reply to a similar question, he writes,

دو روزوں کا حکم آپ صلی اللہ علیہ و سلم نے خاص یوم عاشوراء کے سلسلہ میں دیا تھا، اس دن یہود بھی روزہ رکھتے تھے، آپ

کو جب اس کا علم ہوا تو ان کے تشبہ سے بچنے کے لیے دسویں محرم کے ساتھ ایک اور روزہ ملا کر رکھنے کا حکم دیا، فی زمانہ

جب کہ یہود اس دن روزہ نہیں رکھتے، خیال ہوتا ہے کہ صرف ۱۰/ محرم کو بے روزہ رکھ لیا جائے تو قباحت نہیں، ہاں! احتیاط دو روزے رکھنے میں ہے، یہ اور اس طرح کے حدیث سے ثابت دوسرے روزے نفل ہیں اور باعث ثواب۔

The Nabi ﷺ made fasting two days specific to Ashooraa. The Jews use to also fast on this day. When the Nabi ﷺ became aware of what they use to do, then he added another day in order for the Muslims to refrain from resembling them.

However, in a time where the Jews do not fast this fast, then it is thought that fasting the 10th of Muharram exclusively is not wrong. Yes, on account of precaution, one should fast the two fast. Because there are Hadith which are established for it and the other day is a Nafl fast which brings about blessings.

(کتاب الفتاویٰ، جلد ۳/۴۴۶، زمزم پبلشرز)

There are many more statements from our scholars for both views, but these mentioned are sufficient.

In conclusion, both views are within the Hanafi Madhhab and they are both substantiated with evidences. However, what is best is that a person fasts on the 9th and 10th of Muharram or even the 10th and 11th of Muharram.

If however, for some reason he is unable to do so, then he may observe the 10th alone and he will be rewarded for doing so.

فقط واللہ اعلم بالصواب

Written By:

Saeed Ahmad Khan

Darul Iftā | Darul Uloom Trinidad and Tobago

March 4th, 2021.

Checked and Approved:

Muftī Waseem Khan حفظه الله

Darul Iftā | Darul Uloom Trinidad and Tobago

Head Muftī | Chairman